



STATE OF ISRAEL

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development

Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

FINAL REPORT OF AN AUDIT CONDUCTED IN

ARGENTINA

28 OCTOBER TO 8 NOVEMBER 2018

EVALUATING THE EQUIVALENCE OF THE FOOD SAFETY SYSTEM
FOR BOVINE MEAT EXPORTED TO ISRAEL



STATE OF ISRAEL

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development

Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

1. INTRODUCTION

The Israeli Veterinary Services and Animal Health (IVSAH) conducted an audit in Argentina from 28 October to 8 November 2018. The audit team was comprised of two auditors from the IVSAH Central Competent Authority (CCA). Representatives from the Argentinian CCA accompanied the auditors throughout the entire audit.

The opening meeting was held on 29 October 2018 in Buenos Aires with SENASA. At this meeting, the objectives and itinerary of the audit were confirmed.

2. OBJECTIVES

This was a routine equivalence verification audit. The objective of this audit was to evaluate whether the Argentinian food safety system is equivalent to that of the IVSAH and will therefore be eligible to export bovine meat to Israel.

The entire inspection chain was evaluated to determine whether Argentina's official controls are sufficient to ensure that the food being exported to Israel is unadulterated and safe for human consumption, that there is minimal possibility for the entrance of animal disease, and that animal welfare is protected.

The specific objectives for this audit were the evaluation of the use of the rotating restraint box in establishments, animal welfare during kosher slaughter, traceability of meat throughout the manufacturing process, and the effectiveness of official controls regarding noncompliances and verification of corrective actions by the CCA. The auditors also verified the corrective actions implemented because of the 2017 audit findings.



STATE OF ISRAEL

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development

Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

In order to achieve these objectives, the following sites were visited:

AUDIT SCOPE SUMMARY			
Visit/meeting		Number	Description
Competent Authority	Central (CCA)	2	SENASA
	Regional (RCA)	3	
	Local (LCA)	5	Veterinary Inspectors within each establishment audited

3. LEGAL BASIS

The audit was undertaken under the general provisions of Israeli legislation and in particular Animal Diseases Regulations, (Meat Importation), 1974.

4. BACKGROUND

Argentina has approved to export bovine meat to Israel for over 20 years. Argentina exports both fresh and frozen beef to Israel, including beef with an extended shelf life.

5. FINDINGS: OFFICIAL CONTROLS

SENASA promulgates directives regarding Israeli requirements for export and performs audits of establishments exporting to Israel.



STATE OF ISRAEL

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development

Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

One establishment that was approved for export by SENASA and has been sending bovine meat to Israel did not abide by the standards required by the IVSAH. It is noted that the establishment has performed immediate corrective actions and has since returned to the approved list.

There was a wide range of abilities noted in the performance of the RCAs verification duties and their training. Some of the local and regional veterinarians that were audited were not sufficiently knowledgeable HACCP/SSOP/SPS principles and verification techniques and lacked documentation of verification procedures performed as part of their duties. In several establishments the veterinarians performed monitoring procedures instead of verification procedures. Some of the LCAs were not sufficiently familiar with the establishment's self-control program to verify its' implementation.

Competent Authority Assessment

Item Number	Item	scale							
1	Legal base including laws, rules and procedures	8. Good							
2	The structure of the Competent Authority (CA) ensures compliance with equivalence.	8. Good							
3	The Central Competent Authority maintains a good domain over the entire inspection chain.	5. Below Sufficient							
4	Training at the three veterinary inspectors levels of control.	5. Below Sufficient							
5	Supervision of the CA over the self-control food safety programs implemented by the establishments.	7. Satisfactory							
6	Reliability.	6. Sufficient							
7	The health status of inspected establishments is reflected in the records of official controls and inspection services.	7. Satisfactory							
8	Official Controls meet the requirements of the State of Israel.	6. Sufficient							
		Equivalence Level 6.5							
Very poor	Poor	Very insufficient	Insufficient	Below Sufficient	Sufficient	Satisfactory	Good	Very good	Excellent
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10



STATE OF ISRAEL

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development

Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

6. FINDINGS: TRACEABILITY

A traceability exercise was performed in four establishments. One facility was unable to provide full traceability documentation of the slaughter lot either from a traceability exercise or from preshipment review.

7. FINDINGS: ANIMAL WELFARE

Kosher slaughter with a rotating restraint box was observed in all five abattoirs. In general, slaughter abided by the IVSAH requirements. In two establishments, the drop from the restraint box to the bleeding bed was too steep. In one establishment, the workers were not waiting the minimum bleeding time.

Establishment Assessment

Item Number	Item	scale
1	Infrastructure	6 Sufficient
2	Maintenance	8 Good
3	Sanitation	6 Sufficient
4	Processes & activities	7 Satisfactory
5	Self-Control Programs (food- Safety): HACCP, SSOP, PRPs, GMPs, SPSs, Pathogen Reduction	7 Satisfactory
6	Self-Control Programs (Others): Animal Welfare, Food Defense, etc	7 Satisfactory
7	Self Sampling of products and analysis results	7 Satisfactory
8	Traceability, Recall, Training	7 Satisfactory

Equivalence Level **6.9**

Very poor	Poor	Very insufficient	Insufficient	Below Sufficient	Sufficient	Satisfactory	Good	Very good	Excellent
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10

8. CLOSING MEETING



STATE OF ISRAEL

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development

Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

A closing meeting was held on 8 November 2018 with representatives of the competent authorities. At this meeting, the main findings of the audit were presented by the auditors.

9. NONCOMPLIANCES

A complete list of all noncompliances observed can be found on the IVSAH website www.foodinspection.co.il.

10. CONCLUSION

During the audit there were no significant human health risks that need to be immediately addressed. However, there are significant noncompliances that must be addressed, most specifically regarding official controls in order remain in conformance with the IVSAH requirements. The most significant issue is regarding the standards used to list an establishment as eligible to export to Israel.

In addition, SENASA must ensure the uniformity of training and performance of the regional and local competent authorities regarding the IVSAH requirements.

SENASA is requested to post proposed corrective actions and estimated date of implementation to the website for approval by IVSAH. The implementation of these corrective actions should be verified by the SENASA and will be verified by the IVSAH during a subsequent audit. The IVSAH may request additional information regarding Argentina's inspection procedures related to verification of establishment HACCP systems. The IVSAH will continue to evaluate the Argentinian food safety system based on these actions and will notify you of our final determination.