



**STATE OF ISRAEL**

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development  
Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

FINAL REPORT OF AN AUDIT CONDUCTED IN

SPAIN

18 NOVEMBER TO 30 NOVEMBER 2018

EVALUATING THE EQUIVALENCE OF THE ANIMAL HEALTH CONTROLS AND FOOD  
SAFETY SYSTEM FOR TABLE EGGS EXPORTED TO ISRAEL



## STATE OF ISRAEL

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development  
Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

### 1. INTRODUCTION

The Israeli Veterinary Services and Animal Health (IVSAH) conducted an audit in Spain from 16 December to 24 December 2018. The audit team was comprised of two auditors from the IVSAH Central Competent Authority (CCA). Representatives of the Spanish CCA accompanied the auditors throughout the entire audit.

The opening meeting was held on 19 November 2018 in Madrid with MAPA and MSCBS. At this meeting, the objectives and itinerary of the audit were reviewed.

### 2. OBJECTIVES

This was a routine equivalence verification audit. The objective of this audit was to evaluate whether the Spanish food safety system is equivalent to that of the IVSAH and will therefore continue to be eligible to export table eggs to Israel.

The entire inspection chain was evaluated to determine whether Spain's official controls are sufficient to ensure that the eggs being exported to Israel are unadulterated and safe for human consumption, and that there is minimal possibility for the entrance of animal disease.

The specific objectives for this audit were the evaluation of the national Salmonella monitoring program in layers, and the effectiveness of official controls regarding noncompliances and verification of corrective actions by the CCA. The auditors also verified the corrective actions implemented as a result of the 2017 audit findings regarding table eggs.

AUDIT SCOPE SUMMARY			
Visit/meeting		Number	Description
Competent Authority	Central (CCA)	2	MAPA and MSCBS
	Regional (RCA)	3	2 (in sorting plants), 1(in farm)
	Local (LCA)	10	Veterinary Inspectors within each establishment audited 5 (in sorting plants), 5 (in farms)
Laboratory		1	Regional Laboratory of Castilla
Farms/sorting plants		5	Sorting plants
		5	Farms associated with the sorting plants

### 3. LEGAL BASIS

The audit was undertaken under the general provisions of Israeli legislation and in particular Animal Health Regulation (Import and Export of Animal Products) – 1988.

### 4. BACKGROUND



## STATE OF ISRAEL

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development  
Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

Spain is approved to export table eggs, bovine and ovine meat to Israel. During the 2017 audit, there were a significant number of unresolved noncompliances from 2016 which were to be evaluated during the present audit.

### 5. FINDINGS: OFFICIAL CONTROLS

In the sorting plants, several IVSAH requirements such as inspection of grading and loading of table eggs into the container by official controls are only partly performed. The CCA does not perform yearly audits of listed establishments (only one audit in order to approve the plant for export) which is a possible source of the discrepancy between enforcement standards and effective communication of IVSAH standards to each establishment. In addition, RCAs do not perform periodic audits every 4 months in the establishments to evaluate the establishment. and the LCA's performance. In general, the CCA does not evaluate the performance of the LCA as part of their periodic audits. The RCA is expected to evaluate the LCA by the CCA every 4 months as per IVSAH requirements and not only once yearly.

In the farms, no CCA and RCA audits were performed (neither to evaluate the farm nor to evaluate the LCA). When inspecting farms, the LCA primarily performs a documentary review and does not address noncompliances on the farm. This is evidenced by a disparity between the hygienic and biosecurity quality of the farms visited and quality reported in LCA documentation.

### Competent Authority Assessment

Competent Authority Assessment									
Item Number	Item	scale							
1	Legal base including laws, rules and procedures	9. Very good							
2	The structure of the Competent Authority (CA) ensures compliance with equivalence.	6. Sufficient							
3	The Central Competent Authority maintains a good domain over the entire inspection chain.	4. Insufficient							
4	Training at the three veterinary inspectors levels of control.	6. Sufficient							
5	Supervision of the CA over the self-control food safety programs implemented by the establishments.	6. Sufficient							
6	Reliability.	8. Good							
7	The health status of inspected establishments is reflected in the records of official controls and inspection services.	6. Sufficient							
8	Official Controls meet the requirements of the State of Israel.	6. Sufficient							
		Equivalence Level 6.4							
Very poor	Poor	Very insufficient	Insufficient	Below Sufficient	Sufficient	Satisfactory	Good	Very good	Excellent
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10

### 6. FINDINGS: SALMONELLA MONITORING

No significant noncompliances were evidenced during the audit.



## STATE OF ISRAEL

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development  
Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

### Establishment Assessment

Item Number	Item	scale
1	Infrastructure	9. Very good
2	Maintenance	8. Good
3	Sanitation	8. Good
4	Processes & activities	8. Good
5	Self-Control Programs (food- Safety): HACCP, SSOP, PRPs, GMPs, SPSs, Pathogen Reduction	8. Good
6	Self-Control Programs (Others): Animal Welfare, Food Defense, etc	
7	Self Sampling of products and analysis results	8. Good
8	Traceability, Recall, Training	9. Very good
		Equivalence Level 8.3
		Very poor    Poor    Very insufficient    Insufficient    Below Sufficient    Sufficient    Satisfactory    Good    Very good    Excellent 1    2    3    4    5    6    7    8    9    10

#### 7. CLOSING MEETING

A closing meeting was held on 29 November 2018 in Madrid with the Central Competent Authority. At this meeting, the main findings of the audit were presented by the auditors.

#### 8. NONCOMPLIANCES

A complete list of all noncompliances observed can be found on the IVSAH website [www.foodinspection.co.il](http://www.foodinspection.co.il).

#### 9. CONCLUSION

During the audit there were no significant human health risks that need to be immediately addressed. However, there are significant noncompliances that must be addressed, most specifically regarding official controls in order remain in conformance with the IVSAH requirements. It is of particular concern that there are a number of noncompliances for which no corrective actions were performed by the CCA.

At this time, The CCA has not shown to be equivalent with the IVSAH. The CCA is requested to respond within one month with proposed corrective actions to restore equivalence with the estimated date of implementation. In addition, proposed corrective actions should be posted to the website regarding each noncompliance for approval by IVSAH. The implementation of these corrective actions should be verified by the CCA.

Further to a telephone discussion after the audit, a proposal was made to remove Spain's ability to prelist establishments. The CCA will select five establishments that are to be approved for export to Israel. The CCA is expected to audit them on an annual basis. In



## **STATE OF ISRAEL**

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development  
Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

addition, IVSAH will perform an annual audit in Spain of the official controls and of those five establishments to renew their approval to export to Israel.

If this proposal is acceptable, please send the list at your earliest convenience and an audit will be scheduled for 2019.