



STATE OF ISRAEL

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

FINAL REPORT OF AN AUDIT CONDUCTED IN

THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION

16 DECEMBER TO 24 DECEMBER 2018

EVALUATING THE EQUIVALENCE OF THE ANIMAL HEALTH CONTROLS AND FOOD
SAFETY SYSTEM FOR TABLE EGGS EXPORTED TO ISRAEL



STATE OF ISRAEL

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

1. INTRODUCTION

The Israeli Veterinary Services and Animal Health (IVSAH) conducted an audit in Russia from 16 December to 24 December 2018. The audit team was comprised of three auditors from the IVSAH Central Competent Authority (CCA). A representative of the Russian CCA accompanied the auditors throughout the entire audit.

The opening meeting was held on 16 December 2018 in Moscow with FSVPS. At this meeting, the objectives and itinerary of the audit were confirmed.

2. OBJECTIVES

This was a primary equivalence evaluation audit. The objective of this audit was to evaluate whether the Russian food safety system is equivalent to that of the IVSAH and will therefore be eligible to export table eggs to Israel.

The entire inspection chain was evaluated to determine whether Russia's official controls are sufficient to ensure that the food being exported to Israel is unadulterated and safe for human consumption, that there is minimal possibility for the entrance of animal disease, and that animal welfare is protected.

The specific objectives for this audit were the evaluation of the national Salmonella monitoring program in layers, traceability and storage conditions of eggs, and the effectiveness of official controls regarding noncompliances and verification of corrective actions by the CCA.

AUDIT SCOPE SUMMARY			
Visit/meeting		Number	Description
Competent Authority	Central (CCA)	2	FSVPS
	Regional (RCA)		Associated with each sorting plant and farm
	Local (LCA)	3	Veterinary Inspectors within each establishment audited
Laboratory		1	“Leningrad Interregional Veterinary Laboratory”
Farms/sorting plants		3	Sorting plants Farms associated with the sorting plants

3. LEGAL BASIS

The audit was undertaken under the general provisions of Israeli legislation and in particular Animal Health Regulation (Import and Export of Animal Products) – 1988.

4. BACKGROUND



STATE OF ISRAEL

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
 Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

This was the first time that an IVSAH mission has been in Russia to evaluate table eggs. Three sorting plants and their associated farms have expressed an interest in becoming approved to export table eggs.

5. FINDINGS: OFFICIAL CONTROLS

The CCA does not audit establishments that are approved for export and the RCA audits establishments once every three years. IVSAH requirements are that every exporting establishment is audited at least once yearly by the CCA and every four months by the RCA. The audits should include an evaluation of the performance of the RCA and LCA as well as verifying the corrective actions performed as a result of the previous audit's non-compliances.

The LCA is not required to perform daily verifications of the establishment's food safety programs (HACCP, SSOP, or SPS), or document the noncompliances observed and the verification of the completion of corrective and preventive actions by the establishment. The establishments are permitted to perform a hazard analysis in their HACCP program for the entire production of table eggs instead of a hazard analysis for each step in the production.

Competent Authority Assessment

Item Number	Item	scale
1	Legal base including laws, rules and procedures	8. Good
2	The structure of the Competent Authority (CA) ensures compliance with equivalence.	8. Good
3	The Central Competent Authority maintains a good domain over the entire inspection chain.	4. Insufficient
4	Training at the three veterinary inspectors levels of control.	6. Sufficient
5	Supervision of the CA over the self-control food safety programs implemented by the establishments.	5. Below Sufficient
6	Reliability.	9. Very good
7	The health status of inspected establishments is reflected in the records of official controls and inspection services.	5. Below Sufficient
8	Official Controls meet the requirements of the State of Israel.	3. Very insufficient
		Equivalence Level 6
		Very poor 1 Poor 2 Very insufficient 3 Insufficient 4 Below Sufficient 5 Sufficient 6 Satisfactory 7 Good 8 Very good 9 Excellent 10

6. FINDINGS: SALMONELLA MONITORING

The national control monitoring program for Salmonella in laying hens is not sufficient for the IVSAH. The national program should include a vaccination program and environmental sampling every 15 weeks for the presence of Salmonella at the farm level with a testing method that is equivalent to EU standards. In addition, the IVSAH additionally requires sampling of every flock at least once yearly by official controls.

7. FINDINGS: TRACEABILITY AND STORAGE CONDITIONS

There were significant lapses of sanitation standards in the establishments audited that increase the risk of egg contamination. Documentation regarding the LCA's evaluation of the establishment's performance did not allow a trend analysis to be performed to see if the deficiencies noted during the audit were isolated incidents or the general standard of the establishments. In addition, the absence of a CCA audit of each establishment requesting



STATE OF ISRAEL
 Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
 Veterinary Services and Animal Health, P.O.B 12, Beit –Dagan, 50250

export did not allow the auditors to confirm that the standards evidenced at the establishments are what the CCA approves for an export facility.

Establishment Assessment

Item Number	Item	scale
1	Infrastructure	7. Satisfactory
2	Maintenance	6. Sufficient
3	Sanitation	7. Satisfactory
4	Processes & activities	8. Good
5	Self-Control Programs (food- Safety): HACCP, SSOP, PRPs, GMPs, SPSs, Pathogen Reduction	4. Insufficient
6	Self-Control Programs (Others): Animal Welfare, Food Defense, etc	
7	Self Sampling of products and analysis results	4. Insufficient
8	Traceability, Recall, Training	7. Satisfactory
Equivalence Level		6.1

Very poor	Poor	Very insufficient	Insufficient	Below Sufficient	Sufficient	Satisfactory	Good	Very good	Excellent
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10

8. CLOSING MEETING

A closing meeting was held on 24 December 2018 in Moscow with the Central Competent Authority. At this meeting, the main findings of the audit were presented by the auditors.

9. NONCOMPLIANCES

A complete list of all noncompliances observed can be found on the IVSAH website www.foodinspection.co.il. A copy is attached to this report.

10. CONCLUSION

Based on the findings listed above, the CCA has not shown to be equivalent with the IVSAH. If so desired, the CCA should respond with proposed corrective actions to prove equivalence with the estimated date of implementation. In addition, proposed corrective actions should be posted to the website regarding each noncompliance for approval by IVSAH. The implementation of these corrective actions should be verified by the CCA after approval by the IVSAH.

After the CCA verification of each noncompliance, discussions can recommence how to further proceed.